



Minutes of the 21st ECOSAI Governing Board Meeting

October 17, 2016

Ankara, Turkey

The 21st ECOSAI Governing Board Meeting was held on October 17, 2016 in Ankara, Turkey. Following members attended the meeting as heads of delegation.

- Mr. Seyit Ahmet BAS, President of the Turkish Court of Accounts and President of the ECOSAI.
- Rana Assad Amin, Auditor-General of Pakistan and Secretary General of ECOSAI.
- Dr. Mohammad Sharif Aman Sharifi, Auditor General, Supreme Audit Office of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan.
- Mr. Mahdi Dehrouyeh, Advisor to President, Supreme Audit Court, Islamic Republic of Iran.

Complete list of participants is at Annexure-I.

1. Opening of the Meeting:

Mr. Seyit Ahmet BAS, President of the Turkish Court of Accounts, Turkey / President of the ECOSAI and host of the 21st ECOSAI Governing Board Meeting welcomed the delegates and thanked them for their participation and making the Governing Board meeting a success. Thereafter, the President delivered the opening speech and inaugurated the meeting. During the speech he also mentioned the valour and bravery shown by the people during the failed coup in July 2016. He condemned the coup attempt and informed about the people who were involved in this act. The opening speech of the President of the ECOSAI is placed at Annex-II.

2. Adoption of the Agenda:

The proposed agenda (Annex-III) for the 21st Governing Board Meeting was unanimously adopted.

3. Activity Report by the Secretary General:

Before presenting the Activity Report, Rana Assad Amin, Auditor General of Pakistan/ Secretary General of ECOSAI thanked SAI Turkey for making excellent arrangements for the Governing Board Meeting. While presenting the activity report of the ECOSAI for year 2016, he highlighted significant activities of the organization carried out during 2016. The Secretary General welcomed Seyit Ahmed BAS, the new head of SAI of Turkey and also felicitated Dr. Adel Azar on assuming the position of head of SAI of Iran. He informed the participants about the importance of capacity building initiatives that were undertaken by the ECOSAI and expressed his concern that a training course on Performance Audit had to be postponed during 2016 as a sufficient number of nominations were not received. He stressed that the officers should be nominated to benefit from the training plan of ECOSAI in future trainings that were being offered. He informed that in accordance with the decision of 20th GBM of ECOSAI two issues of ECOSAI circular were published, he mentioned that contributions from SAIs were increasing which is an encouraging sign. He also mentioned that the Strategic Plan 2016-21 has been prepared and will be presented to the GBM before presentation to the Assembly. The Secretary General Report is placed at Annex IV.

4. Presentation of the Annual Accounts of ECOSAI for the year ended 31 December 2015 and Budget for the years 2016 – 2018 by the Secretariat:

Mr. Khurram Raza Qureshi, Director General (IR&C), SAI Pakistan presented the accounts of the ECOSAI for the year ending December 31, 2015 and ECOSAI budget for the years 2016 – 2018 with a brief description of new and important heads of account in the budget statement. The accounts were approved by the Governing Board unanimously and the budget was approved by the Governing Board for presenting it before the 7th Assembly meeting of ECOSAI.

5. Presentation of the Training Committee Report

Mr. Khurram Raza Qureshi, Director General (IR&C), SAI Pakistan presented the report of the 16th ECOSAI Training Committee Meeting (TCM) held on October 17, 2016 at Ankara, Turkey

for approval of members of the Governing Board. The report included proposals for holding long duration training courses, proposal for arranging internships as suggested by TCA and inviting experts from member SAIs for knowledge sharing during the training courses. In addition, a brief on the proposals discussed regarding the website of ECOSAI was also discussed. It was informed that the format and allocation of dedicated sections to individual SAIs was appreciated by TCM and it was agreed that the format may be considered for approval besides the proposal that the amount for the remodeling and updation of website may be paid from ECOSAI funds as per existing practice. Moreover, a proposal on sending the training material to member SAIs within an appropriate time period and its translation before commencement of training course was discussed also discussion on skill sets required for trainers, information about preparation of Strategic Plan for approval by Governing Board were included in the report. It was also informed that TCM decided not to entertain the request funding for trainees other than from the member SAIs in ECOSAI training courses. The progress on training plan was reviewed and was termed satisfactory by TCM. The Governing Board approved the 16th ECOSAI Training Committee Report and its recommendations. Report is placed at Annex - V.

6. Report on the publication of the ECOSAI Circular by the SAI Pakistan

Director General IR&C informed the forum that as decided in the 20th Governing Board Meeting, the ECOSAI Circular is to be issued on half yearly basis and accordingly the ECOSAI Secretariat has published two issues of the ECOSAI Circular Spring and Autumn 2016 issues. The Secretariat appreciated the efforts of the SAI Turkey that arranged printing of two ECOSAI Circulars during 2016 i.e. Spring 2016 and Autumn 2016 issues and sent it to member SAIs. The Autumn issue was shown to the participants during the meeting. It was informed that separate sections were allocated to publish contributions from member SAIs and sections allocated to SAIs were arranged in an alphabetical order. The members were apprised that seven SAIs had contributed to the ECOSAI Circular which was commended by the GBM and appreciated the efforts made by SAI Turkey and ECOSAI Secretariat. The SAI Turkey offered that they will arrange printing of ECOSAI circular on regular basis. President TCA proposed that any changes in the organization of the SAIs may also be included in the circular.

The report on printing of circulars were unanimously approved by the Governing Board.



7. Discussion on the draft ECOSAI Strategic Plan 2016-2021

Mr. Yusuf Ada, Principal Auditor from SAI Turkey presented the salient features of the ECOSAI Strategic plan 2016-21 which was prepared by the committee formed during 20th Governing Board Meeting of ECOSAI for this purpose. It was informed that the ECOSAI draft Strategic Plan for 2016-2021 was circulated among member SAIs for comments and the suggestions/comments were incorporated in the draft plan. The draft Strategic plan was also shown to the 16th TCM held on October 17, 2016 at Ankara, Turkey. The draft of the ECOSAI Strategic Plan for 2016-2021 was unanimously approved by the Governing Board for presentation before the Assembly.

8. Update on the issue of ECOSAI to become a regional member of INTOSAI

Secretary General ECOSAI informed the GBM that as decided during 20th Governing Board meeting the ECOSAI Secretariat initiated a proposal for the INTOSAI Secretariat to admit ECOSAI as Regional Working Group of INTOSAI.

Upon request of the ECOSAI Secretariat ,INTOSAI has included this issue in the agenda for the upcoming 68th Governing Board meeting of INTOSAI to be held on December 5, 2016 at Abu Dhabi, UAE under agenda item No. 22. It was decided that the ECOSAI Secretariat will present its report on this issue and progress if any during the next meeting of the ECOSAI Governing Board.

The Governing Board took note of the issue and agreed to the proposal.

9. Other matters

Under this agenda item , the Secretary General ECOSAI presented five proposals:

i) Importance of MoUs between member states

The Secretary General ECOSAI urged the member states to enter into MoUs terming them as an important vehicle for knowledge sharing. He reiterated that MoUs will facilitate the member states in their efforts to cooperate in different areas of public sector auditing.

ii) Non attendance of Heads of some member SAIs in GBM Assembly meetings

The Secretary General ECOSAI expressed his concern that some Heads of SAIs did not attend the Governing Board and Assembly meetings. He urged the need to identify the bottlenecks and also stressed that the reasons for non participation should be communicated to Secretariat in writing to inform if they have financial issues, language issues or there is any other reason for non participation. Moreover, SAIs of Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan have never attended the meetings and it is important for Central Asian States to participate as the organisation cannot move forward with the participation of a few states. The Secretary General proposed that a committee of 2-3 member states may be constituted to identify the issues that hinder the attendance of member states. SAI Turkey proposed that SAI Iran may help in finding the reasons by consulting with the ECO Secretariat in Tehran. SAI Afghanistan opined that the non participating SAIs must inform the secretariat about their non availability and any cogent reason in this regard. SAI Iran proposed that the secretariat may visit the non participating SAIs to discuss with their respective Heads and find a workable solution. The Secretary General clarified that the committee is to be constituted to find out the reasons through consultation and if needed the members may visit the non participating states if the reasons can not be ascertained through discussion and diplomatic means.

Secretary General further urged that a working group of 3 member states may be constituted to identify the reasons for non attendance and then circulate the findings to all member SAIs and SAI Iran can discuss the matter with ECO Secretariat as well.

iii) Contributions for ECOSAI

Secretary General ECOSAI explained that contributions from member SAIs was enhanced from \$500 to \$US1000 recently. Moreover, IDB should not be relied upon as the only external funding mechanism rather the member SAIs should contact international donors like World Bank, USAID, Asian Development Bank, DFID etc to receive funds and remittances. He informed that World bank has already agreed to assist peer review of SAI Pakistan and other SAIs may take a lead from this.

iv) Business of auditing ECO

The Secretary General ECOSAI suggested that SAI Iran could take up the case of conducting external audit of the ECO Secretariat in Tehran by the audit teams from ECOSAI. He further informed that a provision has been made in the budget for receipts on account of fees from audit of ECOSAI. SAI Iran agreed to take up the matter with ECO Secretariat in Iran.

v) Possibilities of Cooperative Audit (Joint Audit and Parallel Audit)

Secretary General proposed that committees /working groups/task force may be constituted to explore the possibilities of Joint and Parallel Audits among member SAIs. SAI Turkey expressed the view that they may have limitations in this respect due to the legislation but anyhow acknowledged that this activity can serve as a good knowledge sharing platform.

SAI Iran expressed the opinion that the laws and regulations in SAIs may differ and the cooperative audits may be decided after exploring the common possibilities and taking into account limitations of mandate and guiding legislation.

SAI Turkey agreed with the establishment of sub committees /working groups/task force to frame strategic working plans and SOPs for cooperative audit after taking into consideration the legislative limitations and also cooperation in the areas like Performance Auditing, Environmental auditing, IT auditing etc. The Secretary General urged that Central asian states must also be proactive in these task forces.

It was decided that these issues will be further discussed in the Assembly Meeting to be held on 18th October, 2016 .

10. Closing address by Mr. Seyit Ahmet BAS, President of the Turkish Court of Accounts.

In his closing address, Mr. Seyit Ahmet BAS, President of the Turkish Court of Accounts and President of the ECOSAI thanked all the delegates for their active participation in the 21st GB meeting and expressed satisfaction with the proceedings of the GB.



Mr. Seyit Ahmet BAS,
President of the Turkish Court of Accounts and President of the ECOSAI

Rana Assad Amin,
Auditor-General of Pakistan and Secretary General of ECOSAI

Dr. Mohammad Sharif Aman Sharifi,
Auditor General of the Supreme Audit Office of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan

Mr. Mahdi Dehrouyeh,
Advisor to President, Supreme Audit Court, Islamic Republic of Iran